



October 19, 2012 C-17749-2012 400 HOLIDAY DRIVE, SUITE 300 PITTSBURGH, PA 15220-2727 412.921.4030 PHONE 412.921.9960 FAX

www.gatewayengineers.com

ALCOSAN 3300 Preble Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15233

ATT: Dan Lockard, P.E.

RE: Comments to the ALCOSAN Wet Weather Report

Borough of Carnegie

Dear Dan:

On behalf of the Borough of Carnegie we have reviewed the ALCOSAN Wet Weather Report and we have the following comments:

1. Section 9.3.3 Page 9-80 reads as follows — "In some cases, even after the follow-through coordination was completed, information from a particular municipality was still incomplete, was judged to be unreliable or a preferred control strategy could not be clearly identified. In these cases, the basin planner assumed a control strategy, assumed a level of control and the associated costs, and/or identified areas within the existing municipal sewer system that had adequate hydraulic capacity to convey peak wet weather flow to the ALCOSAN system and where no capital improvements or control facilities were required." This same assumption is stated throughout the report.

<u>Comment:</u> The Borough of Carnegie has indicated that they will be conveying all flow to ALCOSAN. The report indicates that POCs C-26, C-33, C-38B and C-45A are all separate sewer POCs. However, only C-26, C-32, and C-45A are separate POCs. The remaining POCs in Carnegie are combined POCs.

2. Section 11 indicates throughout that municipalities will start construction immediately following the approval of the Feasibility Plans.

<u>Comment:</u> If the municipalities complete their construction projects prior to ALCOSAN's projects, how will the additional flows be handled? If ALCOSAN's line cannot (due to not being constructed or not being part of the Recommended Plan) accept the flows, municipal flows could create new hydraulic issues to their systems or downstream municipalities. Carnegie has numerous POCs that surcharge due to the Chartiers Interceptor. If internal conveyance restrictions are removed prior to the new ALCOSAN facilities being constructed, additional flooding and surcharging will occur.



October 19, 2012 C-17749-2012 Page Two

- 3. We understand that the proposed alternatives in the Wet Weather Plan for ALCOSAN consist of installing a relief sewer along Jane Street, Mansfield Blvd, W. Main Street, 1<sup>ST</sup> Street and Kinney Ave and a consolidation sewer along 1<sup>ST</sup> Ave. Since this plan is conceptual in nature, Carnegie would like input on the actual location of these sewer lines and regulator structures as some locations depicted in the plan may have better locations for access and construction with less disruption of local residences and businesses. We would also like more information on volumes allowed through various regulator structures and flows from Carnegie being diverted at these structures from existing Carnegie sewer lines.
- 4. We have reviewed the cost estimates and residential indicator of 2.6%, and we do not see a major issue with this estimate. However we will be refining the cost estimates and user fee analysis under the Feasibility Study for Carnegie due to the PADEP in July 2013 and will be evaluating alternative financing methods to reduce the cost to rate payers.

If you have any questions, or need further clarification do not hesitate to contact us.

Sincerely,

THE GATEWAY ENGINEERS, INC.

Richard D. Minsterman, P.E.

Project Manager

cc: Jeffrey C. Harbin, Borough Manager

Borough Council

Philip R. Strunk, P.E., Borough Engineer

G:\Projects\17000\17749 Feasibility Study Alternatives\2012\-1204 Carnegie\Docs\Carnegie Alcosan Wet Weather Report Comments 10-15-12.docx